Environmental and Social Audit Report

West Bank and Gaza Emergency Social Protection

COVID-19 Response Project

Funded by the World Bank Group

Submitted to

Palestinian Ministry of Finance

Prepared by Consultant

Fa'ed Awashreh

July 17th, 2021

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACRONYMS....2

1. Executive Summary....3

2. Introduction....4

3. Background of the Project....5

4. Environmental and Social Audit....7

4.1 Scope and purpose of E&S audit....7

4.2 Audit Methodology....7

4.3 Data Collection....8

4.3.1 Semi-structured interviews....9

4.3.2 Field work....10

5. Policy, Legal and Regulatory Framework....11

6. Management of Environmental and Social Risks and Impacts of the Project....11

7. Implementation of Project components with focus on the E&S issues....11

8. Findings/ audit results....12

9. Conclusion....0

10. Recommendation....0

ANNEXES....0

Annex 1: Questions of interviews- Ministries....1

Annex 2: List of interviewees- Ministries....3

Annex 3: Lists of Beneficiaries....4

Annex 4: Questions of interviews- Beneficiaries....7

Annex 5: Examples of media interviews....8

ACRONYMS

CoC	Code of Conduct
CTP	Cash Transfer Program
C4W	Cash for Work
ESF	Environmental and Social Framework
ESHS	Environmental Social Health Services
ESMF	Environmental and Social Management Framework
ESPRP	Emergency Social Protection COVID-19 Response Project
ESS2	Labor and Working Conditions
ESS4	Community and Health Safety
GBV	Gender-Based Violence
GRM	Grievance Redress Mechanism
LMP	Labor Management Procedure
MoF	Ministry of Finance
MoH	Ministry of Health
MoL	Ministry of Labor
MoLG	Ministry of Local Government
MoSD	Ministry of Social Development
OHS	Occupational and Health Safety Plan
PAD	Project Appraisal Document
PFESP	Palestinian Fund for Employment and Social Protection
PCU	Project Coordination Unit
PDO	Project Development Objective
POM	Project Operation Manual
SEP	Stakeholder Engagement Plan
WB&G	West Bank and Gaza

1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The West Bank and Gaza (WB&G) Emergency Social Protection COVID-19 Response Project (ESPRP) aims at providing cash support and short-term employment opportunities to vulnerable populations in the West Bank affected by COVID-19. The project was declared effective in August 2020, with a total budget amount of 30 million US dollars. It consists of 4 components, with a developmental objective of provision cash support and short-term employment opportunities to vulnerable populations affected by COVID-19 in West Bank and Gaza Strip (WB&G).

The task of this environmental and social (E&S) audit has been managed by the Ministry of Finance (MoF) and the audit itself has been carried out by an external consultant. The objective of the audit is to assess compliance of the ESPRP activities that have been implemented - specifically those related to Subcomponent 1.1 (Emergency Cash Transfer to households vulnerable to poverty), Subcomponent 1.2 (Financing of the Cash Transfer Program (CTP)-funding gap), and Component 4 (Contingency Emergency Response) - with the requirements identified in the environmental and social (E&S) instruments prepared by MoF, the main implementer of the project, and the commitments included in the project's Environmental and Social Commitment Plan (ESCP). Since no activities have been conducted under Components 2 and 3, other than procurement and installation of a few computers under Component 3, these two components are not included in the audit.

The audit employed three main qualitative research methods: (i) desk and content review of the project documents; (ii) semi-structured interviews with key staff at the project implementing ministries; and (iii) field visits to interview beneficiaries.

A total of 68 semi-structured interviews with project implementers and beneficiaries were conducted for purposes of data collection. 8 key project staff members were interviewed during face-to-face meetings with MoF, Ministry of Labor (MoL) and Ministry of Social Development (MoSD). A total of 60 project beneficiaries were interviewed including: 29 project beneficiaries over the phone for Component 1 (Emergency Cash Transfers in the West Bank); 14 project beneficiaries over the phone for Component 4 (Contingency Emergency Response); and, 17 project beneficiaries during site visits of West Bank governorates including 4 in the north (Tubas), 7 in the south (Bethlehem), and 6 in the middle (Jericho).

The *conclusion of the audit reveals partial compliance with the project's E&S commitments and mitigation measures and standards* as stipulated in the project's ESCP and E&S management instruments respectively. The analysis of the data shows that the project implementers (institutional stakeholders) are aware of and appreciate the importance of effective E&S management. Most importantly, they are committed to proper and effective management of the project's E&S risks and impacts and to improving their institutional capacity and performance in this regard as the project proceeds further.

The *E&S audit also reveals some findings on non-compliance that needs to be addressed*. The project's Environmental and Social Management Framework (ESMF) and Labor Management Procedures (LMP) were cleared and disclosed after the disbursement of the cash transfer as opposed to the commitment in the ESCP which required these instruments to be prepared and disclosed two months (June 2020) prior to project effectiveness and before starting

relevant activities. Furthermore, cash was disbursed prior to the updating of the preliminary Stakeholder Engagement Plan (SEP) and conducting the requisite public consultations as opposed to the ESCP commitment which required that the SEP update, including public consultations, will be completed within XX months of project effectiveness. The primary reason for this non-compliance was the emergency of the nature of the Project and the pressing need to provide immediate assistance. Also, no monitoring and reporting was done and/or shared with the Bank during the implementation of components 1 and 4 due to the delay in hiring the Project Environmental and Social Officer (ESO). Also, while complaints systems within the implementing ministries were functioning, the Project level grievance redress mechanism (GRM) was established in January 2021, after the hiring of the ESO in December 2020.

The main recommendations based on the findings of the audit are as follows: MoF will ensure compliance with the E&S monitoring and reporting requirements as stated in the ESCP. The ESO and the Health and Safety Specialist (HSS) will also ensure that E&S commitments and requirements, as recorded in the ESCP and E&S instruments respectively, are met. The ESO and the HSS will closely follow-up on and monitor E&S implementation and regularly report on Environmental, Social, Health and Safety (ESHS) performance. A commitment to increase the frequency of monitoring and reporting will be included in the ESCP. A Code of Conduct (CoC) has to be prepared in Arabic; explained to and distributed among all project workers; and, signed by all project workers in accordance with the project's LMP. Public consultation meetings need to be conducted in line with the provisions of the updated SEP, and a well-functioning project level GM and workers' Grievance Redress Mechanism (Workers' GM) has to be maintained throughout the life of the project. Information about the grievance mechanisms, including GBV/SEA/SH tools, is to be disseminated widely so that all project stakeholders, also including vulnerable groups, can access the GM in case of project related complaints.

2. INTRODUCTION

The outbreak of the COVID-19 crisis in the West Bank and Gaza (WB&G) has exacerbated the already-deteriorated health and socio-economic conditions of Palestinians, especially among the poorest and most vulnerable groups such as elderly people, people with disabilities, and households headed by women.

In WB&G, this crisis impacted negatively on significant numbers of households resulting in these households falling into poverty (or deeper into poverty). Necessary measures to contain COVID-19 have forced thousands of Palestinians out of work and labor, significantly impacting their livelihoods.

The ESPRP, with its four components as detailed later, aims to respond to the immediate needs arising from the COVID-19 pandemic, while also contributing in the medium term to broader development goals in West Bank and Gaza, such as economic inclusion and private sector development.

3. BACKGROUND OF THE PROJECT

The West Bank ESPRP aims to provide cash support and short-term employment opportunities to vulnerable populations in WB&G affected by COVID-19. The implementation of the project started in August 2020, in collaboration with several partners including MoF, MoSD, MoL, and the Palestinian Fund for Employment and Social Protection for Workers (PFESP).

The Project consists of four components:

Component I: Emergency Cash Transfers in the West Bank and Gaza (US$ 18.36 million) with two subcomponents:

Subcomponent 1.1 finances a one-time cash transfer to around 57,000 vulnerable households from the West Bank that are currently not benefiting from the CTP program. This subcomponent aims to reach households that were vulnerable to poverty prior to the pandemic, as well as workers who have lost their income due to the pandemic, in addition to households with vulnerable members, such as children and persons with disabilities, in areas especially affected by the COVID-19 outbreak. The MoSD, through the CTP program unit, is expected to be the data curator, data administrator, and system developer to ensure data entry and cross-verification with other systems to guarantee the quality of the information. Moreover, the MoSD will be the entity triggering and administrating payments to selected households based on their accumulated experience with payments under the CTP.

Subcomponent 1.2 finances the CTP funding gap, ensuring that CTP beneficiaries from West Bank and Gaza receive the 2nd quarterly payment for 2020 to cover their basic needs and avoid falling deeper into poverty. It targets households that were already poor prior to the pandemic and are likely to fall further into poverty as the result of crisis. This subcomponent is being implemented by the MoSD, building on the ongoing CTP registry and the operating delivery systems.

Component II: Cash for Work in the West Bank (C4W) (US$ 8 million)

This component finances temporary employment opportunities for approximately 3,060 beneficiaries (of which at least 1,530 are women). This component provides Cash for Work (C4W) through sub-grants to selected NGOs in charge of implementing the C4W subprojects. Supported subprojects focus on health, education and other social services provided by NGOs to vulnerable groups affected by COVID-19, but also include income-generation initiatives to assist vulnerable populations recover from the crisis, such as for example, livelihood activities in agriculture.

Component III: Capacity Building Project Management, Monitoring and Evaluation (US$ 2 million)

This component aims to ensure that the Project Coordination Unit (PCU) housed at the MoF and the technical entities working directly with the PCU are fully operational and have the capacity to implement the project in conformity with the Legal Agreement, PAD and the Project's Operations Manual. The component supports the PCU, the MoSD, the MoL, and the PFESP with respect to:

1. The management, monitoring and evaluation (M&E) of project activities.

2. Capacity building support to the relevant staff to ensure the smooth and effective implementation of the ESPRP includes various areas such as:

   - Design, communication and outreach, identification, registration, needs assessment, beneficiary enrollment, payment mechanism, management information system, and grievance and redress system.
   - Technical assistance to support the enrollment of vulnerable households.
   - Development of a high-frequency crisis monitoring survey, including a high-frequency phone survey to monitor the socioeconomic impacts of COVID-19 and the mitigating effects of Project interventions on beneficiary households.
   - Management of CTP registry and the operating delivery systems.

Component IV: Contingency Emergency Response (CERC)

With the significant surge in COVID-19 cases in Gaza following project effectiveness, the MoF requested the Bank to expand the project's geographic coverage to Gaza under sub-component 1.1 (Emergency Cash Transfers to the West Bank). The request targeted 16,000 households, 8,000 Gazan households registered in the CTP waiting list and 8000 not CTP registered but impacted by the pandemic and its economic implications. These "newly poor" registered during the COVID-19 crisis, brought the total amount of the reallocation required to US$3.28 million. As such, the CERC was activated on May 27, 2021. In close coordination with MoF and MoL, MoSD is taking the lead in triggering and administrating payments to selected households, after adequate cross-checking and validation of beneficiaries. To date, over 5,600 households out of the end target of 8000 households in Gaza impacted by the COVID-19 pandemic have received one emergency cash transfer.

The Project's ESMF, LMP and updated SEP were cleared and disclosed on both the World Bank's and the PA's website on May 7, 2021. Activities financed under the CERC will be limited to those services described in a positive list in the Emergency Operations Manual and those in compliance with the Project ESMF. It is therefore not required to develop an ESMF specific to the CERC. These activities are not expected to induce land acquisition leading to involuntary resettlement, and restrictions on access to resources and livelihoods are not foreseen. An environmental and social safeguards specialist sitting at the PMU since December 2020 will follow up on the monitoring and evaluation aspects of this component. A CERC manual prepared by the PMU was reviewed by the Bank and found satisfactory. The ESMF and the Emergency Operations Manual will be updated to include beneficiaries impacted by the deteriorating socio-economic conditions in Gaza.

The project's planned implementation duration is three years, from August 6th 2020 to December 31st 2023, with a grace period from December 2023 to April 2024.

MoF prepared environmental and social instruments for the Project including the ESMF, LMP, and the SEP before project appraisal. The preparation of the ESMF, SEP, and LMP was guided by the applicable Palestinian regulatory texts including National Health Strategy (2017-2022), Palestinian Labor Law (PLL), 2000, Environment Law No. 7 of 1999 and Palestinian Environment Assessment Policy of 2000, as well as the World Bank's Environmental and Social Framework (ESF) and Environmental and Social Standards (ESSs). All these documents were cleared from the World Bank and published on their website. Also, these documents were

translated into Arabic, and both Arabic and English versions were published on MoF website and the links shared by MoL, MoSD and PFESP.
The project instruments including ESMF, LMP and SEP aim at identifying E&S risks associated with the project implementation, measures to be taken during the implementation of the project to eliminate and mitigate adverse impacts. In addition, MoF is obliged to implement the material measures and actions committed in the ESCP prepared for the project, including measures related to COVID-19 prevention as per the WHO guidance.

4. ENVIRONMENTAL AND SOCIAL AUDIT

4.1 SCOPE AND OBJECTIVE

The objective of this audit is to conduct an E&S assessment for the project, including reviewing the project documents/records and already implemented activities (for the period covering between August 2020- June 2021) in order to assess compliance regarding implementation of the project's E&S instruments and commitments. Compliance has been assessed according to the relevant provisions of the WB environmental and social standards (ESS1, ESS2 and ESS10 which are found applicable to the project activities) as reflected in the ESCP and the project's E&S instruments including ESMF, LMP and the SEP.

The components that are included in the audit are component 1 with subcomponent 1.1 and subcomponent 1.2 and component 4. Since no activities have been conducted under component 2 and 3 except procuring and installation of few computers under component 3, these two components are not included in the audit.

The audit was carried out during a period of three weeks, commencing on June 25th and ending on July 15th.

4.2 METHODOLOGY

After reviewing the project documents including the PAD and the ESF instruments, ESS1, ESS2 and ESS10 are found relevant to component 1 and 4 of the West Bank and Gaza ESPRP which are the subject for the audit. The Auditing Consultant complied with the requirements as defined in the ToR and checked if other ESSs were applicable during the implementation of the project. Furthermore, a methodology was developed and implemented according to established research techniques and standards. As part of the Audit, the Consultant examined the compliance of the environmental, social and legal aspects for the ESPRP.

The environmental and social performance of component 1 and 4 has been assessed through reviewing the project related documents supplemented by field visits and consultation with the stakeholders and project beneficiaries/project affected persons (PAPs). Specifically, the consultancy task covered:

1. A review of project related documents including the ESF instruments; ESMF, LMP, SEP, and other documentation and reporting according to the ESCP.
2. Meetings with the MoF, MoL and MoSD and field visits to collect information on the implemented project activities, PAPs and beneficiaries, including applicable ESSs, due diligence with E&S requirements and the application of the requirements and mitigation measures as per the ESF instruments.

3. Checking and analyzing the conducted activities for compliance with the ESPRP E&S instruments prepared as per the ESF and ESSs including:
    - ESS1 Assessment and Management of Environmental and Social Risks and Impacts: identification of risks and impacts, management programs, organizational capacity and competency, emergency preparedness and response, monitoring and review and stakeholder engagement.
    - ESS2 Labor and working conditions and Occupational Health and Safety (OHS) management including communication and training, workers GM, risk of Gender-Based Violence (GBV) and Sexual Exploitation and Abuse (SEA), workers' legal rights and workforce and Code of Conduct (CoC).
    - ESS10 Stakeholder Engagement and Information Disclosure: Implementation of the SEP including identification of stakeholders and affected persons, appropriate consultation, and dissemination of information.
4. Preparing an E&S Audit checklist listing the results of the audit of the commitments in the different E&S instruments.
5. Identifying and assessing the gaps between the E&S requirements and commitments and the MoF practice and implementation of the ESPRP activities.
6. Preparing an action plan for corrective measures to bridge the gaps that includes specific activities, budgets, and implementation timelines.

4.3 DATA COLLECTION

Following a briefing mission with MoF, it was agreed that the main instruments for collecting data and information from stakeholders will be:

- Document/literature review: the Auditing Consultant reviewed all project documents and ES instruments. This includes the project's PAD, ESCP, ESMF, SEP. Progress reports prepared by the MOF were also examined.
- Interviews: Key informant and stakeholder interviews were the main form of primary data collection during the preparation of the Audit. The range of stakeholder interview targets is indicated in the stakeholder analysis below, and further details are provided in the paragraph discussing field visits/work. In addition, key informant interviews were conducted also with MOF, MOSD and MOL.
- Field Work: field visits were carried out in three governorates in the West Bank. The purpose of field visits was to meet direct beneficiaries at the local level; verify the extent to which the beneficiary selection criteria and E&S requirements and measures were followed during the implementation of the Project; and, document the concerns or grievances, if any, of beneficiaries in relation to the implementation of the Cash Transfer activities.

The data aimed to assess to what extent the measures in the E&S instruments were followed. This includes assessing the relevant Palestinian government instructions regulating the work during the Covid-19 Pandemic, such as those related to the Bank's operation with regard to the disbursement of the beneficiaries' cash assistance. Following is the description of the methodology used for data collection:

4.3.1 SEMI-STRUCTURED INTERVIEWS

Four semi-structured interviews were held on 24/06/2021 with the Project key personnel at MoF to understand the project scope and to gather comprehensive information on the implemented activities related to the relevant components of the project. In addition, another five interviews were conducted with key personnel involved closely in the project implementation at MoSD and MoL, to examine the compliance with the E&S and the extent of interaction and consultation. These interviews also enabled collection of information on the implemented project activities and beneficiaries, including applicable ESSs, due diligence with E&S requirements and the application of the requirements as per the ESF instruments.

Annex # 1 contains the questions that were employed for the data collection from the key staff at the Project implementing ministries. **Annex # 2** contains the list of the relevant interviewees, their positions in the respective implementing ministries.

To assess the satisfaction of beneficiaries regarding the cash transfer procedures, and compliance of project implementers with the relevant E&S measures, a sample of 46 beneficiaries was selected randomly for subcomponents 1.1 and 1.2 (including the field visits mentioned under next section 4.3.2) and another 14 for component 4 (CERC) where beneficiaries have been identified, and around 75% of the allocated cash for this component was disbursed.

The sample of the interviewed beneficiaries (a total of 60) is selected to cover the entire geographical area of the West Bank and Gaza. The sample size is proportional to the number of beneficiaries in each geographical area. The selected sample size of the interviewed beneficiaries is approximately 0.4% of the total number of beneficiaries per the geographical area. The selection criteria of the beneficiaries' sample also took gender into account. Both male and female beneficiaries were interviewed (77% male, 23% female). Following is a table showing the geographical distribution of the beneficiaries interviewed and the total number of beneficiaries per each geographical governorate/area:

No	Governorate	Phone based interviews	Field based interviews	Total beneficiaries interviewed
1	Tubas	10	4	14
2	Tulkarem	1		1
3	Nablus	2		2
4	Qalqilya	3		3
5	Jenin	5		5
6	Bethlehem	4	7	11
7	Hebron	2		2
8	Jericho	2	6	8
9	Gaza	14		14
	Total	**43**	**17**	**60**

For the full lists of beneficiaries, please see **Annex # 3**.

4.3.2 FIELD WORK

A total of 17 field visits were conducted in Jericho, Tubas and Bethlehem governorates to check on the ground the actual living circumstances of the beneficiaries and to verify the extent to which the selection criteria and E&S requirements and measures were followed during the implementation of the Project. Also, the field visits aimed to assess the satisfaction of the beneficiaries on information disclosure, outreach activities and cash disbursement procedures in relation to the E&S measures and element. Following is a table showing the distribution of field visits on WB governorates:

Governorate	**No of field visits**
Jericho	6
Tubas	4
Bethlehem	7
Total field visits	17

Jericho (July 8, 2021)

Jericho (July 8, 2021)

Tubas (July 10, 2021)

Bethlehem (July 11, 2021)

Interview questions aimed at collecting information regarding the extent of beneficiaries' knowledge of the project, in particular, and cash assistance grants in general; the registration for the cash assistance procedures; and challenges related to registering for and collecting the money. The questions also focused on issues related to E&S risks and mitigation measures used during the project implementation by different stakeholders, such as maintaining the health and safety procedures, outreach mechanisms focusing on vulnerable groups, and social impact of the project on the households receiving the cash assistance.

For the questions used in the interviews with beneficiaries, please see **Annex # 4**.

5. POLICY, LEGAL AND REGULATORY FRAMEWORK

The project is required to comply with all relevant national and local laws and regulations including:

- Country specific policy, legal and administrative frameworks relevant to the project.
- World Bank Environmental and Social Standards (ESS) relevant to the project.
- World Bank Group Environmental, Health and Safety Guidelines (EHS Guidelines) relevant to the project.
- National COVID-19 prevention instruction issued by the MoH and WHO guidelines.
- Relevant international good practices technical references such as WHO guidelines.

Those applicable are summarized in the project's ESMF.

6. MANAGEMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL AND SOCIAL RISKS AND IMPACTS

To manage the environmental and social concerns associated with the Project implementation, several environmental and social instruments were developed by MoF according to the Bank's ESF and ESSs including mainly:

- Environmental and Social Management Framework
- Labor Management Procedures
- Stakeholder Engagement Plan for the project

These instruments identified key risks and impacts associated with project implementation, and institutional measures to be taken during implementation of the project to address adverse environmental and social risks and impacts; offset them or reduce them to acceptable levels.

The material measures and actions with which MoF is obliged to comply and implement are included in the ESCP, with a timeline for each. The implementation of these measures is to be monitored and reported to the World Bank by MOF in terms of progress, challenges, modifications and completion, throughout the implementation of the project.

7. IMPLEMENTATION OF COMPONENTS WITH FOCUS ON E&S ISSUES

MoF has prepared the above-mentioned E&S instruments, as applicable, for the implementation of the Project. They were included in, and considered the base for, executing the project's activities. Also, MoF has hired the ESO and the HSS for following up on and monitoring the E&S issues associated with the implementation of Project components. The MOF has also hired a Project's Coordinator to support the ESO and the HSS in implementing

the Bank's policies ensure compliance of the project to the Bank's policies. However, these actions were conducted after MoF has already disbursed US$ 12.4 million (US$ 11.2 million under component 1 and US$ 1.2 million under componemt 4) as part of the cash transfers for vulnerable households who are benefiting from Cash Transfer Program (CTP).

MoF and the project management team carried out a general assessment for the project implementation with regard to the E&S issues, where they documented the findings in their first semi-annual report. The assessment reported some difficulties and challenges faced by ESPRP project management to implement the technical activities of the project "emergency cash assistance" and maintain the E&S measures in accordance with the applicable ESS namely, ESS1, ESS2 and ESS10.

This was communicated with the World Bank, and this audit comes to examine the extent of the compliance with the relevant measures.

8. FINDINGS/ AUDIT RESULTS

After analyzing the data received and collected from both the project implementers and beneficiaries, the E&S audit findings revealed that beneficiaries are satisfied with the E&S measures implemented in the project including disclosure about launching the Project and criteria and procedures for cash assistance registration and cash disbursement.

During the interviews and the field visits that were conducted for the data collection, beneficiaries stated that they observed, witnessed, and experienced the implementation of various E&S measures during the implementation of the Project stages they had to go through, from the inquiry and registration for the cash assistance and receipt of the cash payment. For example, there was a consensus among all the interviewees that the relevant ministries as well as the bank branches adhered to the COVID-19 control measures of social distancing, testing the temperature of clients/ beneficiaries, committing to wearing the mask and gloves and requesting their clients to do so. Similar observation was noted by the E&S audit Consultant who had documented having these measures in place at all the ministries visited for the data collection.

Ministry of Labor (July 4, 2021)

Also, the findings of the desk review, including the MoF progress report which was submitted to the Bank on June 9 2021, shows that MoF and other implementing ministries showed a satisfactory compliance with the E&S measures, fulfilling partially the relevant requirements. Following are the relevant finding detailed in relation to the E&S risks:

Audit of Commitment to ESCP , ESMF, LMP, SEP,	Fully met	Partially met	Not met	Notes/Remarks	Recommendations/Action Plan
A. Audit of Commitment to ESCP					
1. Regular reporting: MoF prepared and submitted to the Bank regular monitoring reports on the environmental, social, health and safety (ESHS) performance of the Project, including but not limited to, stakeholder engagement activities and grievances log.			**√**	No reporting was done and/or shared with the Bank during the implementation of component 1 and 4. The preparation and submission of the first quarter report was delayed till June 17th, 2021 because of the delay in hiring of the ESO which was after the disbursement of component 1 and 4.	MOF to prepare regular monitoring reports related to the implementation of the project's activities in compliance with the ES requirements. Monitoring reports should be prepared in a timely manner and as agreed to in the ESCP.
2. Organization structure: ESO and HSS is hired on 27/12/2020 and 21/2/2021 respectively, which is 4-6 months after the Effective Date of the Project.			**√**	The ESO was hired in December 2020 and HSS was hired in February 2021 after the disbursement of component 1 and 4 had been completed.	For the extension of the project and allocation of additional financing, the assigned ESO and HSS are to respect the commitments and follow up on implementation and report on monitoring of ESHS performance.

3. Preparation of ESF instruments including ESMF, LMP and SEP.			√	The only ESF document that was prepared and disclosed on June 2020, prior to the disbursement, was the preliminary SEP. The ESMF, LMP, and the updated SEP were prepared and disclosed in May 2021 due to delay in hiring the ESO at MoF and after the cash disbursement. The need for disbursement was due to the emergency nature of the project. The design of ESPRP, however, is anchored in and builds on a very strong existing cash transfer delivery system under an ongoing World Bank Project, the Social Protection Enhancement Project/SPEP. In other words, the cash disbursement for ESPRP was done using the existing cash transfer delivery system used for SPEP. This system has been evaluated and was previously rated by the Bank as adequate and robust in terms of oversight; has well-defined eligibility criteria and targeting mechanisms; a functioning project level Grievance Redress Mechanism (GRM); and, with strong coverage and outreach coupled with a strong MIS system. As such, evaluations indicate that the national safety net delivery system is among the best performing cash transfer programs in the world (2017 CTP targeting assessment and WB 2018 State of Safety Nets). In the case of ESPRP the lack of E&S instruments at the time of disbursement raised a non-compliance issue with ESF requirements. ESF instruments were prepared, updated and disclosed on May 7, 2021	ESF documents were prepared, updated and disclosed for the Parent Project. Provisions and timelines in the ESCP shall be adhered to. ESF instruments shall be updated and disclosed for the AF and Restructuring activities and ESCP provisions and timeline will be adhered to. There will be close monitoring and regular reporting to ensure compliance with E&S requirements.
B. Audit of Commitment to ESMF					
Screening process is conducted to determine which activities are likely to have negative environmental and social impacts; to determine the	NA			No screening is required as component 1 and 4 are related to cash transfer and no civil works are included.	-

level of required environmental assessment; determine appropriate mitigation measures for activities with adverse impacts; and incorporate mitigation measures into the subprojects as appropriate.					
Site-specific ESMP is prepared before carrying out of the respective Project activities as indicated in the ESCP.	NA			No site specific ESMP for components 1 and 4 is required.	-
Comply with OHS related to COVID-19	**√**			The relevant ministries as well as the district offices adhered to the COVID-19 Control measures of social distancing, testing the temperature of clients/ beneficiaries, committing to wearing the mask and gloves and requesting their clients to do so. Similar observation was noted by the E&S auditor who had documented that these measures are in place at all the ministries visited for the data collection.	-
Access to Information	**√**			Media and press: a communication plan was developed by MoL to contact the community during the project life period. At first, the Prime Minister's Office announced the project, then MoL carried out more than twelve interviews through local TVs and newspapers. MoSD also carried out several interviews and press releases to update the community on relevant project information and progress. Also, a press release is issued before each payment. See Annex # 5, examples for media and interviews	-

				Messages: More than 50,000 messages were sent to targeted beneficiaries to inform them about their payment and as a reminder to go to their banks to receive their payments. Most of the beneficiaries confirmed receiving the messages. For some elderly who were unable to read, the message was read out to them later by their relatives. Phone calls: more than 32 cell phone SIM cards were distributed to communicate with the beneficiaries/ applicants for the cash assistance. During the data collection of the E&S audit, most of the beneficiaries stated that they were contacted by phone and were reminded to collect their payments allowed for a period of about 2 weeks to receive their money. Social media has been used to announce any information related to stakeholders. MoL and MoSD are using social media extensively to contact a wide range of stakeholders. Some beneficiaries stated that they knew about the Project through Facebook and applied online. Inquires system/mechanism: Applicants wishing to inquire regarding the status of an application can access information on their application status by visiting the front desk of MoL or MoSD at the directorate offices or through the MoL/MoSD portal link. More than 3600 inquiries were documented on the system, and they were answered on the same day as they were received.	
MoF is in-charge of the E&S safeguard monitoring			**√**	No monitoring was done during the project implementation and no reports were shared with the World Bank in this regard	As mentioned above
For consultations and stakeholder engagement, please see details below under the "Audit of Commitment to SEP"					

C. Audit of Commitment to LMP					
Contracts were signed with project workers. Contracted workers are not employed for component 1 and 4.	**√**			Direct workers at MoF-PCU and the environmental and social officer (ESO) and the health and safety specialist (HSS) hired at PCU and the direct workers from MoL and MoSD assigned by the respective ministries to work on the screening/selecting eligible beneficiaries, facilitating the applications, and managing the complaints and inquiries were signed for all.	
Code of contact was considered and addressed			**√**	The project workers are aware of the CoC but they have not signed it.	The CoC requirement has to be prepared in Arabic language, distributed to project staff at the relevant ministries, and signed in accordance with the LMP.
Payments were paid monthly on time	**√**			The payments are paid on time and on regular basis	**-**
Contracts of workers are as to the Palestinian Labor Law (PLL) (No. 07 of 2000), the Council of Ministers Act 11, 2012, and the terms and conditions of work in ESS2 as indicated in the LMP.	**√**			The contract was signed as to the PLL. All workers are above 18 years old.	**-**

D. Audit of Commitment to SEP					
Preliminary SEP was prepared and disclosed in June 2020			**√**	The preliminary SEP was prepared in June 2020 prior to the disbursement	
Several methods were used for information disclosure and stakeholders' engagement		**√**		As part of the information disclosure, different activities were implemented: - Information about the project activities and the eligibility criteria for cash assistance was published through municipalities social media pages (ex Facebook pages), the MoL and MoSD websites and posted announcements. - Several local and international media outlets, such as Palestine TV, Maan News, Ajyal Radio, MontiCarlo, published the Prime Minister's announcement on the project's components (cash transfer and cash for work). - Information about the application process and dedicated electronic forms were published through ministries and municipalities in the West Bank. Over 352,000 application forms for cash assistance were received and registered in the database of the MoL, MoSD and Ministry of Local Government (MoLG). - Several media interviews and press conferences were conducted with the Minister of Labor and Minister of Social Development about the project's component 1 and its implementation modalities (a detailed list of interviews with ministers is provided in Annex 5).	Implement the communication plan prepared by MOF to ensure wider and better outreach to the communities and affected people Log of calls to vulnerable groups, minutes of meetings, and updated SEP Records of tv and radio broadcasts
Stakeholder Public consultation meetings conducted prior to cash transfer.			**√**	Public consultation meetings were not conducted.	Conduct public consultation meetings in line with the provisions of the updated SEP and report regularly on implementation of the SEP

Stakeholder consultation meetings were conducted with affected parties after cash transfer	√			A consultation workshop was carried out on March 29th, 2021 for all stakeholders related to component 1 and component 4, including ministries, municipalities, unions, NGOs and individuals from West Bank and Gaza. However, this came after the cash disbursement	Conduct public consultation meetings in line with the provisions of the updated SEP
Inclusive consultations with relevant ministries and stakeholders	√			All interviewed people at involved ministries confirmed that since the inception of the project, consultations and discussions took place on the project implementation phases including the registration and verification. Tasks were distributed, and data on beneficiaries, shared between ministries and among the same ministry for cross checking and eligibility verification. Eligibility criteria is clearly stated in the Project Operation Manual (POM).	
Functionality of the GRM	√			The project level GRM was developed by MoF in January-2021, after the cash disbursement. The GRM was announced during the consultation workshop conducted on March 29th, 2021, within the SEP. Information about the GRM system was disseminated to the public through different methods, including advertisements, websites and social media of MoL and MoSD. A total of 132 complaints were received and resolved. Complaints were mainly related to eligibility criteria and allocation of cash. As part of the audit, a sample of 10% was analyzed to ensure that the complainants were actually ineligible to receive cash payments and reasons for being unaware of the eligibility criteria. As per the E&S audit conducted, the complaints were addressed in about an average of 3 weeks from their submittal dates.	Maintain a well-functioning project level GRM throughout the life of the project. Information about the grievance mechanisms including GBV/SEA/SH tools to be disseminated to public Maintain GRM Log
Reach-out activities for excluded vulnerable groups	√			The Project addresses concerns related to vulnerable groups, especially through the SEP and the project design. For example, whenever the online support in the project implementation may entail some exclusion risk of vulnerable groups such as persons with IT literacy challenges, the system	Prepare regular monitoring reports related to the implementation of the project's activities in

				allows beneficiaries to approach the nearest MoSD office in their governorate to fill out the form with the assistance of social workers. The project's communication plan included mechanisms to reach out to potentially excluded groups/individuals. Such mechanisms included an Inquiry System that was established in the MOSD district offices where vulnerable groups or persons with IT literacy can inquire about the cash transfer activities and the application process (3000 inquiries were received). In addition, more than 300 municipalities and village councils in the West Bank were requested by the MOLG to disclose information about the cash transfer and eligibility criteria and receive applications (more than 24000 applications were submitted through municipalities). MOSD staff were provided with mobile phones to reach out to people who were eligible for cash transfer and who have applied through municipalities and village councils. Around 60 social workers and employees from the MOL and MOSD in collaboration with MOLG have conducted home visits to around 9000 people within the period of February to July 2021 to inform them about the cash transfer. This was confirmed by many elderly beneficiaries who stated that they registered for the cash assistance with the help of social workers at MoSD . Registration for the cash assistance was open to all. At the first stage it was through the registration forms that were made available at WB directorates at MoL, MoSD and MoLG offices. More than 350,000 applicants filed registration forms for the cash assistance. This allowed illiterate applicants to file cash assistance applications. Some interviewees stated that they registered for the cash assistance physically at relevant ministries offices, with the assistance of ministries' staff members. Later, relevant documents were published at websites of MoF, MoL, MoSD and World Bank, as well as on social media including Facebook.	compliance with the ES requirements including information on the percentage of outreach to persons with IT literacy and methods used.

				Information about the project activities and the eligibility criteria for cash assistance was published through municipalities' social media pages and posted announcements. The list of eligibility criteria for the project's beneficiaries was published on the MoL and MoSD websites and Facebook pages as follows: MoL: website: http://www.mol.pna.ps/page/55 Facebook: https://www.facebook.com/402414063423950/posts/1462334457431900 / MoSD: website: https://mosd.gov.ps/ar/node/1491 Facebook: https://www.facebook.com/339075549468817/posts/3812664698776534/ Divorced women and households headed by women were given a consideration in the selection criteria.	
GBV/SEA/SH	**√**			The Project has established a GRM manual and specific mechanisms for filing complaints. This GRM was updated to be sensitive to GBV/SEA/SH issues and resolution of such complaints as well as proportionate to the potential risks and impacts of the Project As the case with the GRM, also a GBV mechanism was introduced and discussed through a consultation workshop. The workshop was conducted on March 29th, 2021 with the attendance of more than 60 institutions. According to the audit interviews conducted, and as per the Project implementers, to this moment no GBV complaints have been received	Maintain a well-functioning project's level GRM. Information about the grievance mechanisms including GBV/SEA/SH tools to be disseminated to public

9. CONCLUSION

The audit found a partially satisfactory compliance by the project regarding the E&S measures. In general, the Project is currently maintaining needed E&S measures and standards, along with the E&S risk management tools and instruments.

The E&S team including the ESO and HSS at PCU-MoF is now on board and operating in line with the implementation plan and activities of the project.

Eligibility criteria included in the POM, that are developed before the disbursement of the cash transfer through consultations with the implementing partners, have been applied to assure the beneficiaries receiving cash transfers are eligible.

Compliance with OHS related to COVID-19, Labor and working conditions except for CoC, access to information had been observed.

Within the context of the SEP several consultation workshops have been implemented and as well planned along with the implementation progress of the project.

However, there has been non-compliance in the implementation of the ES instruments prepared for the project mainly for components 1 and 4 related to cash transfer in West Bank and Gaza. The non-compliance is due to the following:

1- Grant funds under Component 1 were disbursed immediately upon project effectiveness and prior to conducting public consultations with the project's affected parties and prior to updating the preliminary SEP.
2- The project's level GRM was established and became functional after the disbursement of the funds under Components 1 and 4. The GRM manual, along with specific mechanisms for filing complaints was developed by MoF in January-2021. To date, 132 complaints were received and resolved.
3- The project's ESMF was cleared and disclosed after the disbursement of cash transfer.
4- The LMP was cleared and disclosed after the cash transfer was affected.
5- The ESO and HSS were hired in December 2020 and February 2021 after the disbursement under components 1 and 4 has been completed. No monitoring and reporting was done and/or shared with the Bank during the implementation of component 1 and 4.
6- Project's staff are aware of the CoC but they have not signed it

Such noncompliance needs to be addressed in the planning of the activities for the remaining lifetime of the project. Other than this, no additional material E&S risk was detected during the audit requiring the Project to launch any further corrective management plan

10. RECOMMENDATION

The findings recommend that the project continues applying the E&S measures and procedures as incorporated in different instruments and revising them as necessary. Same recommendation applies to the effective operation of human resources and tools employed towards achieving the intended goals of the project, with an emphasis on the implementation of the project instruments along the lifetime of the project.

Taking corrective actions regarding the implemented activities is not feasible due to the fact that the implemented activities have been completed and all instruments were prepared, disclosed and shall be implemented for the remaining activities of the project.

However, on the basis of the findings of this audit, a ***corrective action plan*** – including measures to ensure compliance with E&S requirements and commitments and to strengthen management of E&S impacts – is recommended in the table below. This corrective action plan is to be implemented during the life of the project and any additional financing. The ESCP will be updated to include a commitment to implement the corrective action plan and the updated ESCP will be disclosed after Bank clearance. Requisite finances for undertaking the recommended actions will be provided by the recipient (MoF).

RECOMMENDED CORRECTIVE ACTION PLAN TO BE IMPLEMENTED BY MOF

Action	**Indicator for implementation**	**Responsibility**	**Time frame**
Develop and conduct a beneficiary survey to ensure that eligible beneficiaries and vulnerable groups are not excluded from project benefit. The survey should be developed and conducted in a timeframe and in a manner that are acceptable to the Bank	Beneficiary survey conducted	PCU at MoF	Two surveys have been conducted, after the first and second payments. A third survey planned in October 2021 and will address the required action
MoF should respect the reporting periods as stated in the ESCP.	Quarterly and annual reports are produced and submitted to the Bank	PCU at MoF	Quarterly report every three months The next report will be in October 2021, then every three months a quarterly report will be submitted
Ensure constant and continuous reporting to ensure and verify the level of commitment of MOF to the ESCP and the E&S instruments' implementation. Number of reports submitted to the Bank's ES team to be increased from quarterly to every two months.	To be agreed with the Bank	PCU at MoF	2 monthly E&S compliance reports to start from January 2022
The ESO and HSS are to ensure that the E&S commitments are fulfilled and there is compliance with E&S	All mitigation measures as stated in the project instruments are	ESO and HSS at PCU	Throughout the project life cycle

provisions and implementation timelines and report on the monitoring of ESHS performance.	implemented, monitored and reported		
The CoC requirement has to be prepared in Arabic language, distributed to project workers, and signed in accordance with the LMP.	CoC is prepared and signed by project workers	ESO and HSS at PCU	CoC in Arabic available in September 2021. To be circulated among and signed by all project workers.
Conduct additional consultations including at least one consultation in each province, specifying eligibility criteria and informing stakeholders about the possibility of lodging grievances and receiving payment ex-post in case of exclusion. The timeframe for conducting these consultations should be agreed with the Bank.	Additional consultations completed and reports shared with the Bank	ESO and HSS at PCU	To be started in November 2021
Public consultation meetings need to be conducted in line with the provisions of the updated SEP.	Summary of the consultation meetings is reflected in the project's ESMPs and included in the progress reports	ESO/PCU	Throughout the project life cycle
• Maintain a well-functioning project's level GRM. Information about the grievance mechanisms including GBV/SEA/SH tools and disseminate to public • Develop specific GBV / SEA / SH grievance redress channels that ensure complainant and victim's	Number of grievances received and resolved Number of GBV/SEA/SH cases received and handled	ESO/PCU ESO/PCU	Throughout the project life cycle Throughout the project life cycle

anonymity and information confidentiality. • Monitor grievance performance and report to the Bank	GM report submitted to the Bank every two months	ESO/PCU	To be submitted in the 2 monthly E&S reports starting January 2022
Establish a worker's GM including GBV/SEA/SH tools	Number of the workers complaints, received, resolved and reported in the progress reports	ESO/PCU	To be submitted in the 2 monthly E&S reports starting January 2022
Capacity Building for the ESO and the PMU team on ESF instruments to be conducted, including topics of GBV/ SEA/ SH.	Training sessions on the ESF requirements are conducted	World Bank team	To be conducted in November 2021

ANNEXES

ANNEX 1: QUESTIONS OF INTERVIEWS- MINISTRIES

E&S Audit Questions/ for Ministries

Name and Title:
Ministry:
Day and time :
Interview lasted from: till:

Questions:

Regarding inclusive consultation:

- How the eligibility of beneficiaries for cash assistance was verified? What is the role of each ministry? Are you satisfied with this mechanism Did you participate in the workshop held by MoF- PCU in March 2021? What was your role?
- How do you evaluate the workshop? Did it conclude its objectives?
- What are the parties that participated ? Do you consider participants represent the whole Palestinian community? Was there any specific party missing?
- How the selection criteria for the cash assistance was set?
- What problems/challenges you faced/ are facing with the inclusive consultation?

Regarding access to information:

- What problems you faced while launching the Project in terms of accessing all population? How they were tackled?
- How the Project, including the cash assistance announcement, was launched?
- How do you evaluate the reach out activities for all the community targets including the marginalized?

Regarding the marginalized/vulnerable groups:

- In your opinion, to what extent the project is being effective in its activities targeting vulnerable/ marginalized groups, such as women, elderly people and the poorest?
- According to your knowledge, what is the role of social workers involved in the Project regarding clarifying conditions and procedures for cash assistance applications, for vulnerable/marginalized groups especially the elderly?
- What are the procedures that were considered in the Project for the benefit of people with disabilities? For example, was there a beneficiary in a distant area with no bank account? How this issue was resolved? Or if there are any other similar cases?
- If there is one element/issue you wish to change in the Project, whether its design or implementation regarding the vulnerable/marginalized groups, what could it be?

Regarding the E&S impacts/risks:

- How do you evaluate the implementation of the WBG E&S measures?

- How the E&S risks were tackled during the disbursement of cash payments?
- What kind of reporting/ feedback you received regarding the GBV from the community? How the Project tackled it?
- Did you receive/document any social conflicts among the stakeholders, especially beneficiaries, during the Project implementation? How they were addressed and by whom?
- For the WHO guidelines and social distancing rules, what was the most difficult issue you faced? What were the impacts and how you addressed them?
- In your opinion, what are the positive and negative impacts of the Project? How were they addressed?

Regarding the public health and safety,

- What are the measures that are taken by the Project implementers/ partners with regard to COVID-19 control?
- What are the issues relevant to the Project stakeholders' health and safety? Have you ever received or conducted any training on this issue? Or did the Project include relevant activities? What kind of training or activity?
- Where there any incidents with regard to the project stakeholders' health and safety? What were the reasons? What parties you communicated with?
- Have you ever communicated with Health and Safety officer at MoF-PCU? For what reason was the communication and what role he assumed?

Regarding the complaints and GRM, GBV

- Did you receive any complaints? How many? About what? How they were addressed?
- What is the mechanism for receiving or reporting complaints?
- Is there any recommendation or further issue you want to address?

ANNEX 2: LIST OF INTERVIEWEES- MINISTRIES

No	Name and Title of Interviewee	Ministry
1	Anas Shihada, Head of coordination unit/WB	MoF
2	Mohammad Abu Baker, Environmental and social officer	MoF
3	Muhsin Said, Procurement & Grants Specialist	MoF
4	Muna Ghannam, Project Coordination Unit – Coordinator	MoF
5	Mohammad Al-Araj, Director General of employment	MoL
6	Dana Ismail, Resident technical advisor	MoL
7	Ayman Sawalha, EX MoSD staff	MoSD
8	Hanadi K. Barahma, General Director for poverty alleviation	MoSD
9	Bushra N. Sbeahat	MoSD

ANNEX 3: LISTS OF BENEFICIARIES

Beneficiaries of Sub-Components 1.1 and 1.2

No	Name	City/area		Interview Method
1	Salah Ibraheem Hasan Sawalmeh	Tubas	Al- Fari'a camp	Phone call
2	Fawziyya Sadeq Mohamad Daraghmeh	Tubas	Tubas	Phone call
3	Na'eema Sadeq Bayir Abu Ali	Tubas	Tayaseer	Phone call
4	Jihad Mohamad Rafiq Daraghmeh	Tubas	Tubas	Field visit
5	Fawzi Saeed Hussein Sawafta	Tubas	Tubas	Field visit
6	Najeeb Shager Khalil Al-Mubaslat	Tubas	Tubas	Field visit
7	Maryam Arabi Bashir Jabareen	Tubas	Tubas	Field visit
8	Jihad Hazaa' Abdel Rahman Ghoul	Tubas	Al-Far'ia camp,	Phone call
9	Mohamad SabriMahmoud Sayyed	Tubas	Aqqabeh	Phone call
10	Khitam Khader Mustafa Abu Aisha	Tubas	Tammoun	Phone call
11	Kareema Mohamad Ahmad Jaloudi	Tubas	Tammoun	Phone call
12	Mohamad Radi Jameel Deek	Tubas	Tayaseer	Phone call
13	Yousef Hamdan Yousef Sbaih	Tubas	Tayaseer	Phone call
14	Ibraheem Naji Omar Daraghmeh	Tubas	Tubas	Phone call
15	Shaymaa' Omar Izzat Issa	Bethlehem	Al-Khader	Phone call
16	Alaa' Ahmad Mohamad Shawawreh	Bethlehem	Ash-shawawreh	Phone call
17	Mohamad Yousef Ahmad Da'dou'	Bethlehem	Bettir	Phone call
18	Khawla Abdel Rahman Taqatqa	Bethlehem	Beit Fajjar	Field visit
19	Abdel Muttaleb Mohamad Thawabteh	Bethlehem	Beit Fajjar	Field visit
20	Mahmoud Ismail Abdel Rahman Taqatqa	Bethlehem	Beit Fajjar	Field visit
21	Nabeeh Mahmoud Mustafa Zeer	Bethlehem	Harmala	Field visit
22	Salah Mahmoud Ahmad Amyah	Bethlehem	Dar Salah	Field visit
23	Riyad Mohamad Ali Makhtoub	Bethlehem	Za'tara	Field visit
24	Zareefa Ahmad Mohammad Sheikh	Bethlehem	Mrah Rabah	Field visit

25	Ayham Mohammad Ghrouf	Jericho	Jericho	Field visit
26	Suleiman Khalil Ghrouf	Jericho	Jericho	Field visit
27	Ziyad Suleiman Abu Rumi	Jericho	Jericho	Field visit
28	Ibraheem Hasan Abu Saleem	Jericho	Jericho	Field visit
29	Sabah Hasan Jalayteh	Jericho	Jericho	Field visit
30	Jahiziyya Nimer Damra	Jericho	Jericho	Field visit
31	Ibraheem Jaber Abed Ali	Bethlehem	Wadi Rahhal	Phone call
32	Bassam Nayif Aref Jarrar	Jenin	Al-Hashimiyya	Phone call
33	Rasmiyya Mohamad Salih	Jenin	Jenin Camp	Phone call
34	Othman Sa'eed Othman As-sidda	Qalqilya	Jeet	Phone call
35	Fadel Ahmad Jibreel Raba'i	Yutta	At-Tawwaneh	Phone call
36	Mohamad Ibraheem Mohamad Assida	Qalqilya	Jeet	Phone call
37	Mohamad Tayseer Naim Saber	Tulkarem	Tulkarem Camp	Phone call
38	Mohamad Ali Abed Shatat	Yutta	Zeef	Phone call
39	Maryam Khader Abdullah Bani Ghura	Jenin	Jenin camp	Phone call
40	Muyassar Jum'a Saeed Baker	Jericho	Aqabet Jaber camp	Phone call
41	Najeh Abdel Raheem Hasan Hamada	Jenin	Zbooba	Phone call
42	Najeh Mohamad Said Alawneh	Jenin	Emm Et-tout	Phone call
43	Naser Ahmad Ali Basiouni	Nablus	Ein Beit Al-Ma’ camp	Phone call
44	Yasir Abdel Hameed Thabet	Jericho	Ein As-Sultan camp	Phone call
45	Yasir Mohammad Lafi Sanawbar	Nablus	Yetma	Phone call
46	Qasim Husein Qasim Barham	Qalqilya	Kufr Qaddoum	Phone call

Beneficiaries of Component 4 (CERC)

No	Name	City/Area	
1	Ezz eddin Mahmoud Abu Aisheh	Gaza	Gaza
2	Sami Ismail Jafar Dahdouh	Gaza	Gaza
3	Tahani Salah Eddin Sahmoud	Khan younis	Bani Suhaila
4	Suleiman Foad Suleiman Naser	Gaza	Gaza
5	Mahmoud Numan Abdel Hameed Hirez	Gaza	Gaza
6	Abed Khalid Al-Abed Aqra'	Deir Al-Balah	Deir Al-Balah
7	Nuha Daifallah Atiyya Masri	Rafah	Al-Bayyouk
8	Khalid Ziyad Mohamad Abu Sabla	Khan younis	Al-Fukhari
9	Hamdan Mahmoud Ismail Sha'ir	Khan younis	Khan younis
10	Yasir Jalal Abdel Kareem	Gaza	Gaza
11	Suhaib Mazen Mohammad Odwan	North of Gaza	Beit Hanoun
12	Amjad Majed Mohamad Ghoul	Gaza	Ash-Shati’camp
13	Ashraf Tayseer Diab Munia	Gaza	Gaza
14	Ezz Eddin Mohamad Mahmoud Nassar	North of Gaza	Bedouin Village, Al-maslakh

ANNEX 4: QUESTIONS OF INTERVIEWS- BENEFICIARIES

Questions used in the interviews with the beneficiaries for data collection:

- Please introduce yourself, your social and economic status, number of your family members and the nature of your work
- Have you ever received assistance from MoSD?
- How did you find out about the Project? Did you register and fill out an application?
- When registering, where was the place of your registration?
- Did you need help during registration? Who helped you?
- How did you know that there is a payment that will reach the bank?
- Have you heard the statements of the Minister of Labor, the Prime Minister or any other party about your cash assistance?
- Have you been contacted in any way to be informed that a payment has been received by the bank?
- When you went to the bank, what means of transportation did you use?
- In the event of using public transportation, was the driver committed to the procedures of the MoH regarding Covid-19 control?
- When you arrived at the bank, was the bank abiding by health procedures
- Has anyone contacted you after receiving the payment to inquire or check on your satisfaction?
- What did you do with cash assistance amount?
- What are criticisms you may have towards the cash assistance or the way it is disbursed?
- What are the most important recommendations that you may give us to help us with similar future interventions?

Annex 5: Examples of media interviews

The table below summarizes the dates of media interviews conducted, along with the link to the interview.

Interviewed	Media Agency	Date	Link
Minister Nasri Abu Jish	Watan Agency	2020/12/21	https://www.wattan.net/ar/video/328120.html
Minister Nasri Abu Jish	Watan Agency	2020/11/4	https://www.wattan.net/ar/video/324064.html
Minister Nasri Abu Jish	Watan Agency	2020/9/22	https://www.wattan.net/ar/video/320345.html
Minister Nasri Abu Jish	MoL web site	2020/12/21	http://www.mol.pna.ps/news/549
Minister Nasri Abu Jish	Gaya Radio	2020/9/20	https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=T7DzPkW7kNc&feature=youtu.be
Minister Nasri Abu Jish	Shabab FM	2020/9/14	https://www.facebook.com/MOLPalestine/videos/1964455188637 67/
Minister Nasri Abu Jish and Minister Ahmad Majdalaneh	MoL	2020/12/19	http://www.mol.pna.ps/events/16
Minister Nasri Abu Jish	AlHaya Newspaper	2020/8/15	http://www.alhayat-j.com/ar_page.php?id=55a3268y89797224Y55a3268&fbclid=IwAR2ZQXHNfBYjWvyHtQoKtXK2a_uRl8fSosBZYhhzt9kTn7Bd-MnJrWg6RMY